Random 3-colourings and a phase transition for the 3-state Potts antiferromagnet on a class of planar lattices

Jan M. Swart (Prague)

joint with R. Kotecký (Prague) and A.D. Sokal (New York)

April 10th, 2014
Let $G = (V, E)$ be a locally finite graph with vertex set $V$ and edge set $E$.

For each spin configuration $\sigma : V \rightarrow \{1, \ldots, q\}$, define a Hamiltonian

$$H(\sigma) := \sum_{\{x,y\} \in E} 1_{\{\sigma(x) = \sigma(y)\}}.$$ 

If $V$ is finite, define finite volume Gibbs measures

$$\mu_\beta(\sigma) := \frac{1}{Z_\beta} e^{-\beta H(\sigma)},$$

where $Z_\beta := \sum_\sigma e^{-\beta H(\sigma)}$ is the partition sum.

If $V$ is infinite, then define infinite-volume Gibbs measures through the DLR conditions.

In the zero temperature limit $\beta \rightarrow \infty$, the measure $\mu_\beta$ converges to the uniform distribution on $q$-colourings of $G$ (if there exist any).
A critical number of colours

‘Facts’ believed to be true.

For each infinite quasi-transitive graph $G$, there is a $q_c$ such that:

- For $q < q_c$, the model has a phase transition at some $0 < \beta_c < \infty$ between disorder and long-range order.
- For $q > q_c$, the model is disordered even at zero temperature.
- For $q = q_c$, the zero-temperature model is critical (?).
A critical number of colours

‘Facts’ believed to be true.

For each infinite quasi-transitive graph $G$, there is a $q_c$ such that:

- For $q < q_c$, the model has a phase transition at some $0 < \beta_c < \infty$ between disorder and long-range order.
- For $q > q_c$, the model is disordered even at zero temperature.
‘Facts’ believed to be true.

For each infinite quasi-transitive graph $G$, there is a $q_c$ such that:

- For $q < q_c$, the model has a phase transition at some $0 < \beta_c < \infty$ between disorder and long-range order.
- For $q > q_c$, the model is disordered even at zero temperature.
- For $q = q_c$, the zero-temperature model is critical (?)
For each infinite quasi-transitive graph $G$, there is a $q_c$ such that:

- For $q < q_c$, the model has a phase transition at some $0 < \beta_c < \infty$ between disorder and long-range order.
- For $q > q_c$, the model is disordered even at zero temperature.
- For $q = q_c$, the zero-temperature model is critical (?).

On $\mathbb{Z}^d$ with nearest-neighbour bounds, it is believed that $q_c = 3$ in dimension $d = 2$ and $q_c \to \infty$ as $d \to \infty$. 
Recall that a graph $G = (V, E)$ is bipartite if the vertices can be partitioned into two subsets $V = V_0 \cup V_1$ such that each edge has one endvertex in $V_0$ and the other in $V_1$.

It is often useful to view the sublattices $G_0 = (V_0, E_0)$ and $G_1 = (V_1, E_1)$ as graphs in their own right by connecting vertices that are at distance 2 in $G$.

On bipartite graphs (like $\mathbb{Z}^d$), boundary conditions where one sublattice ($G_0$, say) is uniformly coloured in a single colour ($k$, say) may lead to long-range order, in particular, the percolation of colour $k$ on $G_0$.

Effectively, the second sublattice $G_1$ induces a ferromagnetic interaction on the first sublattice $G_0$. 
An external forcing

It is instructive to add an extra interaction

\[ H'(\sigma) := \sum_{\{x,y\} \in E_0} 1\{\sigma(x) = \sigma(y)\} - \sum_{\{x,y\} \in E_1} 1\{\sigma(x) = \sigma(y)\}. \]

And define Gibbs measures

\[ \mu_{\beta,h}(\sigma) := \frac{1}{Z_{\beta,h}} e^{-\beta H(\sigma) + hH'(\sigma)}. \]

If \( h > 0 \) (resp. \( h < 0 \)), this favours uniform colourings of the sublattice \( G_0 \) (resp. \( G_1 \)). In particular, for \( G = \mathbb{Z}^d \), this breaks the symmetry between the sublattices \( G_0 \) and \( G_1 \).
Phase diagram - speculative!

My guess for $\mathbb{Z}^2$ with $q = 3$.

$$T = 1/\beta$$

- $G_0$ ordered
- $G_1$ ordered

$(0, 0)$
My guess for $\mathbb{Z}^2$ with $q = 2, 3, 4, \ldots$. 

$$T = 1/\beta$$

(0, 0)
My guess for $\mathbb{Z}^d$ with $d \geq 3$ and $q = 3$. 

$$T = 1/\beta$$
At zero temperature, the case $q = 3$ is special:

Let $h : \mathbb{Z}^d \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}$ satisfy

$$|h(x) - h(y)| = 1 \quad \text{if} \quad |x - y| = 1.$$ 

Then

$$\sigma(x) := h(x) \mod(3)$$

is a 3-colouring.

**Fact:** If we fix $h(x_0)$ in one reference point $x_0$, then the mapping $h \mapsto \sigma$ is a bijection, i.e., we can recover $h$ from $\sigma$. 
Height mapping

The red path can be deformed into the blue path so that the height difference between the endpoints stays the same.
Simulations by Ron Peled of a random height mapping on a 100×100 square and the middle layer of a 100×100×100 cube. Simulated using Propp-Wilson’s coupling from the past.
Ron Peled (preprint 2010) has proved that for sufficiently high $d$, a typical height-configuration is flat. This implies (some form of) long-range order for the zero-temperature, 3-state antiferromagnetic Potts model on $\mathbb{Z}^d$.

On the other hand, on $\mathbb{Z}^2$, the fluctuations of the height model are believed to be of order $\log(\text{system size})$. This is similar to what is known for dimer models (R. Kenyon).
Ron Peled (preprint 2010) has proved that for sufficiently high $d$, a typical height-configuration is flat. This implies (some form of) long-range order for the zero-temperature, 3-state antiferromagnetic Potts model on $\mathbb{Z}^d$.

On the other hand, on $\mathbb{Z}^2$, the fluctuations of the height model are believed to be of order $\log(\text{system size})$. This is similar to what is known for dimer models (R. Kenyon).

Is this behavior universal in two-dimensional AF 3-state Potts models?
Four examples of quasi-transitive quadrangulations of the plane.
**Theorem** (R. Kotecký, J. Salas & A.D. Sokal, 2008): The 3-state antiferromagnetic Potts model on the diced lattice has long-range order for $\beta$ sufficiently large.
The diced lattice:

- Is bipartite.
- Is a quadrangulation.
- Admits a height representation.

So why is it different from $\mathbb{Z}^2$?
The diced lattice:
- Is bipartite.
- Is a quadrangulation.
- Admits a height representation.

So why is it different from $\mathbb{Z}^2$?
Explanation 1: broken symmetry

My guess for the phase diagram on the diced lattice.

\[ T = \frac{1}{\beta} \]

- \( G_0 \) ordered
- \( G_1 \) ordered

(0, 0)
Explanation 1: broken symmetry

On $\mathbb{Z}^2$, the sublattices $G_0$ and $G_1$ play a symmetric role, but on the diced lattice, this symmetry is broken.

For the diced lattice, the spatial density of points of $G_1$ is twice as high as for $G_0$. Therefore, it is entropically favourable to paint $G_0$ in one colour and reserve the other two colours to $G_1$. (Certainly compared to doing things the other way around!)

Effectively, this is like applying an external forcing that favours ferromagnetic order on $G_0$ and disfavours it on $G_1$. 
On $\mathbb{Z}^2$, the sublattices $G_0$ and $G_1$ play a symmetric role, but on the diced lattice, this symmetry is broken.

For the diced lattice, the spatial density of points of $G_1$ is twice as high as for $G_0$. Therefore, it is entropically favourable to paint $G_0$ in one colour and reserve the other two colours to $G_1$. (Certainly compared to doing things the other way around!)

Effectively, this is like applying an external forcing that favours ferromagnetic order on $G_0$ and disfavours it on $G_1$.

*Is it possible to counter this with an external forcing of exactly the right strength $h$?*
Theorem [Kotecký, Sokal, S.] Let \( G = (V, E) \) be a quadrangulation of the plane, and let \( G_0 = (V_0, E_0) \) and \( G_1 = (V_1, E_1) \) be its sublattices, connected through bonds along the diagonals of quadrilaterals. Assume that \( G_0 \) is a locally finite, 3-connected, quasi-transitive triangulation with one end. Then there exist \( \beta_0, C < \infty \) and \( \varepsilon > 0 \) such that for each inverse temperature \( \beta \in [\beta_0, \infty] \) and each \( k \in \{1, 2, 3\} \), there exists an infinite-volume Gibbs measure \( \mu_{k, \beta} \) for the 3-state Potts antiferromagnet on \( G \) satisfying:

(a) For all \( v_0 \in V_0 \), we have \( \mu_{k, \beta}(\sigma_{v_0} = k) \geq \frac{1}{3} + \varepsilon \).

(b) For all \( v_1 \in V_1 \), we have \( \mu_{k, \beta}(\sigma_{v_1} = k) \leq \frac{1}{3} - \varepsilon \).

(c) For all \( \{u, v\} \in E \), we have \( \mu_{k, \beta}(\sigma_u = \sigma_v) \leq Ce^{-\beta} \).

In particular, for each inverse temperature \( \beta \in [\beta_0, \infty] \), the 3-state Potts antiferromagnet on \( G \) has at least three distinct extremal infinite-volume Gibbs measures.
The diced lattice

Connecting vertices in the sublattices at distance 2 in the original lattice...
The diced lattice

\[ \ldots \text{yields two graphs } G_0 \text{ and } G_1 \text{ that are dual in the sense of planar graph duality. By assumption, } G_0 \text{ is a triangulation.} \]
Our theorem applies to the lattices (b)–(d), but not to (a).
Examples

Our theorem applies to the lattices (b)–(d), but not to (a).
Recall the dual planar graphs $G_0$ and $G_1$. By assumption, $G_0$ is a triangulation.
We separate vertices with different colours in $G_0$ by contours in $G_1$. 
At zero temperature, contours are collections of simple cycles, since vertices in $G_1$ cannot be surrounded by three different types in $G_0$. 
Peierls argument

For vertices on a contour, only one type is available, while for vertices that are not on a contour, 2 types are available. As a result, for each configuration in which a given cycle is present, we can find $2^{|\gamma|}$ configurations where this contour has been removed, with $|\gamma| = \text{the length of } \gamma$. Thus, the probability of a given cycle $\gamma$ being present is less or equal than $2^{-|\gamma|}$ and the expected number of cycles surrounding a given vertex can be estimated by

$$\sum_{L=6}^{\infty} N(L)2^{-L},$$

where $N(L)$ denotes the number of cycles of length $L$ surrounding a given vertex.
Peierls argument

Let $\tilde{N}(L)$ denotes the number of self-avoiding paths of length $L$ in the honeycomb lattice. Duminil-Copin and Smirnov (2010) have proved that

$$\lim_{L \to \infty} \tilde{N}(L)^{1/L} = \sqrt{2 + \sqrt{2}},$$

i.e., the connective constant of the honeycomb lattice is $\sqrt{2 + \sqrt{2}}$. Since $N(L) \leq L\tilde{N}(L)$, it follows that

$$N(L) \leq \text{constant} \times L \times (\sqrt{2 + \sqrt{2}})^L.$$

Note that $\sqrt{2 + \sqrt{2}} < 2$ and hence the expected number of cycles surrounding a given vertex is bounded by

$$\text{constant} \times \sum_{L=6}^{\infty} 2^{-L} L (\sqrt{2 + \sqrt{2}})^L < \infty.$$
Peierls argument

Using moreover explicit counting of cycles up to length 140 due to Jensen (2006), Kotecký, Salas & Sokal (2008) were able to prove that for any vertex $v_0$ in $G_0$

$$\mathbb{P}[v_0 \text{ is surrounded by a cycle}] < \frac{2}{3}.$$

Using 1-boundary conditions on $G_0$ and letting the box size to infinity, it follows that there exists a zero-temperature infinite-volume Gibbs measure $\mu_\infty$ such that

$$\mu_\infty(\sigma(v_0) = 1) > \frac{1}{3}.$$

In particular, this ‘positive magnetization’ proves Gibbs state multiplicity and long range order.
Improved Peierls argument

For our general class of lattices:

\[ G_0 \text{ triangulation} \ \Rightarrow \ \text{every vertex in } G_1 \text{ has degree 3} \]
\[ \Rightarrow \ \text{connective constant of } G_1 \text{ is } < 2, \]

which implies that the Peierls sum is \textit{finite}, though possibly large. It follows that for every \( \varepsilon > 0 \) there exists a finite \( \Delta_0 \) such that

\[ \mathbb{P}[\Delta_0 \text{ is surrounded by a cycle} \mid \text{no contour intersects } \Delta_0] < \varepsilon. \]

and hence

\[ \mu_\infty\left(\Delta_0 \text{ has colour 1} \mid \Delta_0 \text{ is uniformly coloured}\right) > 1 - \varepsilon, \]

uniformly in the system size, which implies \textit{Gibbs state multiplicity}. With some extra work, we can even prove positive magnetization.
Proof of positive magnetization

(Inspired by Wang-Swendsen-Kotecký algorithm)

Condition on the position of the 3’s. Then the 1’s and 2’s on the remaining sublattice form an antiferromagnetic Ising model. Flipping one sublattice, we can make this ferromagnetic and construct it with the usual random-cluster representation. Then, under the conditional law:

\[ \mathbb{P}[\Delta_0 \text{ uniformly } 1] - \mathbb{P}[\Delta_0 \text{ uniformly } 2] = \mathbb{P}[\Delta_0 \text{ connected to the boundary}]. \]

A finite energy argument shows that if this is positive for some finite \( \Delta_0 \), then it is positive for all such \( \Delta_0 \), in particular, singletons.
The argument can be extended to small positive temperatures by a careful counting of nonsimple contours.
Low temperature stability

Our Gibbs measures satisfy, for all $\beta \in [\beta_0, \infty]$:

(a) For all $v_0 \in V_0$, we have $\mu_{k,\beta}(\sigma_{v_0} = k) \geq \frac{1}{3} + \varepsilon$.

(b) For all $v_1 \in V_1$, we have $\mu_{k,\beta}(\sigma_{v_1} = k) \leq \frac{1}{3} - \varepsilon$.

(c) For all $\{u, \nu\} \in E$, we have $\mu_{k,\beta}(\sigma_u = \sigma_v) \leq Ce^{-\beta}$.

Letting $\beta \to \infty$, we can find a (sub-) sequence of positive temperature Gibbs measures converging to a zero-temperature limit that also has these properties.

In particular, by (c), such a zero-temperature Gibbs measure is concentrated on proper 3-colourings.

In particular, by (c), such a zero-temperature Gibbs measure is concentrated on proper 3-colourings.

Low temperature stability.
Low temperature stability

Why is this important?
Why is this important?

There are trivial counterexamples of zero-temperature Gibbs measures that are not stable, in the sense that they are not the limit of any positive-temperature Gibbs measures.
Low temperature stability

Stiff boundary conditions for the height model...
Low temperature stability

...translate into b.c. for the Potts model that correspond to a unique 3-colouring of the interior.
These Gibbs measures are \emph{not} the limit of any positive temperature Gibbs measures as the temperature is sent to zero.

The reason is that at any $\beta < \infty$, we pay an energetic price of order $L$ (surface effect) to change to more advantageous boundary conditions that lead to an entropic advantage of order $L^2$ (bulk effect).
Theorem
[Huang, Chen, Deng, Jacobsen, Kotecký, Salas, Sokal & S.]
There exist quadrangulations of the plane with arbitrary high values of $q_c$. 
The essential feature seems to be a strong asymmetry between the sublattices.